

Council Minutes

June 26–27, 2011
Washington, DC

Council Members Present:

Judith A. Arter (Division H), Alfredo J. Artiles (Member-at-Large), Arnetha F. Ball (President), Barbara G. Dodd (Division D, via video conference), Dorothy L. Espelage (Division E), William A. Firestone (Division L), Vivian L. Gadsden (Member-at-Large), Marybeth Gasman (Division F), Carl A. Grant (Division B), Kris D. Gutiérrez (Immediate Past President), Nicholas Daniel Hartlep (Graduate Student Council), Etta R. Hollins (Division K), Luis C. Moll (Division G), Laura W. Perna (Division J), Gale M. Sinatra (Division C), Linda E. Skrla (Division A), Ara Tekian (Division I), William G. Tierney (President-Elect), Sharon H. Ulanoff (SIG Executive Committee)

Staff Present:

Felice J. Levine, Phoebe H. Stevenson, Gerald E. Sroufe, Patricia A. Martin

Sunday, June 26, 2011
(Meeting Day 1)

I. Welcome and Introduction by President Arnetha F. Ball

President Arnetha F. Ball called the meeting to order at 8:45 a.m. She welcomed members of Council and AERA staff and thanked the group for attending the first meeting of the 2011–2012 Council. Self-introductions followed. Ball indicated that she was looking forward to working collaboratively with members of Council and staff in the coming year to conduct business on behalf of the Association. Council reviewed the agenda for the meeting.

Motion: To approve the meeting agenda as presented. Approved unanimously.

2. Minutes From Previous Meetings

Council discussed deferring the approval of the minutes of the April 2011 meeting

by e-mail until a later time. As per the AERA bylaws, unanimous consent by members of Council is required to approve a motion outside of a face-to-face meeting, so a vote was taken.

Motion: To authorize the review and approval of the April 2011 Council minutes by e-mail. Approved unanimously.

3. Report of the President

President Ball noted that the transition into her new role as AERA president had gone smoothly. She thanked Past Presidents Kris Gutiérrez and Carol Lee, who assisted and offered advice throughout the transition. She also thanked Gutiérrez and Lee for the wonderful jobs they had done as presidents of the Association and Executive Director Felice Levine and Deputy Executive Director Phoebe Stevenson for the valuable support they had offered during the transition.

Ball briefed Council on the 2012 Annual Meeting theme, “Non Satis Scire: To Know Is Not Enough,” noting that a detailed description about the theme had been published in *Educational Researcher* and posted on the AERA website. She reported on her effort to commission essays from leaders in the field to challenge and provoke the thought of AERA members as they prepare submissions for the 2012 Annual Meeting. It was noted that the essays reflect the opinions of the authors and not of the Association. Ball indicated that six essays had been received and posted on the AERA website to date and that members were invited to respond. The essays and responses will be taken into consideration in the program planning process for the 2012 Annual Meeting. The program will focus on an important component of the AERA mission, which challenges members to use our knowledge to serve the public good, so that AERA can be regarded as an organization that is an agent of change. Ball noted that education research should inform practice and policy.

Ball reported on the 2012 Annual Meeting Program Committee’s planning meeting held in May 2011 in Vancouver, British Columbia, Canada. She indicated that on the day before the Program Committee meeting, she and key AERA staff had met for a half day with their

counterparts from the Canadian Society for the Study of Education (CSSE) and considered explicit ways that AERA and CSSE could collaborate on aspects of the Annual Meeting and encourage submissions from CSSE members. Ball also reported on a meeting of Vancouver-area education researchers that AERA held the same day to discuss ways that the Annual Meeting’s formal program and informal activities could best highlight education research issues in the region and local area. She noted the strong enthusiasm expressed by the CSSE leadership and by local-area colleagues on ways to enhance the 2012 meeting.

Ball indicated that she planned to engage the Indigenous community at the Annual Meeting, inviting key members of the community to attend. Linda Smith, a highly regarded Indigenous scholar, will be the keynote speaker at the Opening Plenary Session.

Ball discussed the appointment of Council members as liaisons to standing committees. Gutiérrez emphasized the importance of Council’s being well informed about the charges of the standing committees. It is instructive and productive for Council members to discuss the responsibilities and role of Council liaisons with members of standing committees.

4. New Opening Plenary Session and Reception at Annual Meeting

Executive Director Felice Levine reported on the well-attended Opening Plenary Session featuring Diane Ravitch at the 2011 Annual Meeting in New Orleans. Levine indicated that the plenary session was an excellent forum for bringing the community of attendees together around a common set of issues. She noted that the Opening Plenary Session for the 2012 Annual Meeting will be a noncompetitive session, to be held at 4:15 p.m. on the first day of the meeting. She indicated that plans are under way to feature a welcoming reception after the session that will be open to all meeting attendees. She reminded Council that at its February meeting it had deferred consideration until the June meeting about whether to continue the International Reception directed to non-U.S. attendees or to develop an alternative

strategy to welcome attendees worldwide. Council was drawn to an opening reception that would invite and reach out to all attendees, and passed a resolution to that effect.

Motion: To replace the International Reception with an Opening Plenary Session and reception that will be open to all attendees. The change will be put in place for three years, to be followed by a review process. Approved unanimously.

5. Report of the Executive Director

Levine welcomed Council members to the AERA Central Office in Washington, D.C. She spoke briefly about the office, noting that AERA has been in this space, a condominium, for the past four years. She expressed the hope that Council could convene one meeting a year at the Central Office.

Levine provided an update on activities undertaken since the April Council meeting. She was pleased to report on an opportunity for AERA to partner with the University of Pennsylvania to submit a joint proposal to host the 2012 National Seminar of the Education Writers Association (EWA). She indicated that, although AERA had collaborated with the Hechinger Institute and with EWA on seminars for writers at the AERA Annual Meetings, the high costs of travel to Vancouver would preclude such an event in 2012. The proposed collaboration with the University of Pennsylvania Graduate School of Education would provide a campus-based meeting opportunity for EWA, which is interested in exploring a different format and venue for its National Seminar.

Levine reported that, after a unanimous resolution by the Executive Board authorizing the executive director to negotiate the sale of the building owned by AERA at 1228 17th Street in Washington, D.C., a sales agreement was signed. Levine is pleased with the sale price, which is within a reasonable range in relation to comparable properties recently sold or on the market. Proceeds of the sale will be used to defray the costs of programmatic activities and related staffing. Levine noted that, due to a favorable interest rate on the tax-exempt bond used to finance the office condominium that houses the AERA Central Office, there is little incentive for AERA to use the proceeds from the sale of the 17th Street property to pay off the mortgage early.

Levine encouraged Council members to review the status reports on the AERA journals, the *Handbook of Research on Teaching*, and the AERA book projects, provided as background information.

6. Membership Report

Levine reported on AERA membership counts to date, which were slightly lower than in the same period in 2010. She indicated that it was premature to determine whether the final numbers would be lower for 2011. She noted that a number of factors may contribute to a slight decline, including the continuing financial challenges faced by members and their institutions, the increase in the number of institutions providing electronic access to AERA journals, and lower Annual Meeting attendance than in 2006–2008.

Levine reported on efforts to reach out to lapsed members, including e-mailed and mailed reminders and phone campaigns. She noted that, although AERA currently offers emeritus member status, which requires 20 or more years of membership, a significant number of retired members are interested in maintaining membership but have not been members for the required number of years. It was suggested that Council consider introducing reduced dues rates for retired members. AERA staff will analyze the potential number of regular members moving into the retired member category and the possible financial implications.

Motion: To investigate and analyze the possibility of introducing a retired member category, and delegating final approval of implementation of the new category to the Executive Board. Approved unanimously.

Levine led a discussion on what it would take to increase AERA membership. Council discussed the importance of providing professional development opportunities and other benefits to members beyond the Annual Meeting and the journals. Involving members at the local level might be one approach, particularly through campus liaisons. Council discussed the value of establishing a subcommittee to look into how AERA can engage education researchers in areas such as workforce education, higher education, and education in the business and medical professions, and how it can reach out to junior scholars and consumers of the Association's work. Council discussed the need to create

opportunities for these individuals, such as preconference workshops.

Motion: The executive director and president will appoint an ad hoc committee of Council to develop a strategic plan for increasing membership by 20%. The plan will be discussed by the Executive Board in October and presented to Council in February. It will take into account the costs to the Central Office of increasing the membership in this manner. Approved unanimously.

7. Annual Meeting Registration Fees

Levine discussed the need to increase nonmember registration fees for the Annual Meeting. Because the meeting registration fees were not increased in alignment with the increase in membership dues in 2011, there was less financial incentive than in the past for nonmembers to join AERA in conjunction with registration for the Annual Meeting. Levine noted that the Executive Board had discussed the need to realign the registration fees and voted to approve the recommendation.

Motion: To accept the recommendation of the Executive Board to increase nonmember registration fees at Annual Meetings. Approved, 18; Abstained, 1.

8. Review of 2010 Financial Report and Audit

Stevenson briefed Council on the financial report and audit for the fiscal year ending December 31, 2010. The Association's year-end financial position was more favorable than budgeted due to a number of factors, including a higher number of registrants at the 2010 Annual Meeting in Denver, lower-than-budgeted meeting expenses, and the staggered hiring of new employees to fill budgeted positions. The report also shows unrealized gain as a result of a healthier stock market.

Ball reported on a conference call meeting that she and Gutiérrez had held with the auditor and noted that the audit showed reasonable assurance that the financial statements set forth are accurate representations of the financial operations of the Association. Ball explained that a subcommittee consisting of the AERA president, immediate past president, and executive director had reviewed the annual audit with the auditor; there followed a discussion that each year includes only the

president and immediate past president in case there are issues that the auditor wishes to report to elected officers about the execution of the fiduciary responsibilities of the executive director. Ball noted that the auditor was very positive about the AERA Central Office and Association operations. She indicated that the subcommittee had reported to the Executive Board on the discussion with the auditor and the outcome of the audit for the Executive Board's further review.

Motion: To approve and accept the recommendation of the Executive Board that the 2010 audit be accepted. Approved unanimously.

9. International Relations Committee

Council discussed the length of term for the chair of the International Relations Committee. Ball indicated that the current chair had assumed the position of chair a year early due to the resignation of the previous chair after one year of chair service. Since the current chair has already served as chair for two years, Council discussed the merit of a change in leadership.

Motion: To provide for a change of leadership in the International Relations Committee in light of the need to have a collaborative relationship between the chair and the Council during this coming year. Approved unanimously.

10. Report and Recommendations From the SIG Executive Committee

Sharon Ulanoff, Chair of the SIG Executive Committee (SIG EC), briefed Council on the report and recommendations on SIGs prepared by the committee. She indicated that the report, based on data collected from surveys of SIG members and SIG chairs as well as from SIG annual reports, sought to provide strategic guidance and recommendations to Council regarding the role and opportunities for SIGs for the next decade. The committee's definition of a healthy and vital SIG is also outlined in the committee's report.

The report's recommendations include a three-year formation period for newly established SIGs, an increase in the required membership count from 45 to 75, and an annual review process to provide a brief evaluation of how each existing SIG is meeting the criteria for healthy and vital

SIGs. The report also recommends ways to facilitate the reinvention or dissolution of an existing SIG and reaffirms the role of the SIG EC as an advisory committee to the AERA Council rather than as an advocate for SIGs.

Ball complimented the SIG EC on the excellent job it had done on the SIG report. She thanked Ulanoff and asked that she convey to the committee Council's appreciation of the rigor and quality of the report.

Motion: To accept the report of the SIG Executive Committee and to signal support for all the recommendations, but to urge the SIG EC to reconsider the three-year comprehensive review process for SIGs. Approved unanimously.

Motion: To authorize the SIG Executive Committee to proceed with implementation planning and provide further thinking to the Executive Board in October, including on the periodicity of SIG reviews and strategies to address SIG-to-SIG and SIG-to-division intellectual connections. A final report will be submitted to Council at its February meeting. Approved, 17; Abstained, 2.

Motion: To commend the SIG Executive Committee for its leadership and hard work. Approved unanimously.

Council encouraged SIGs to identify other SIGs that share close intellectual connections in the coming year. The AERA Central Office will perform an analysis on membership overlaps among SIGs and feature groupings on the AERA website to improve the ease of searches for relevant SIGs by members and education researchers.

11. Council Action on Member Status

After reviewing the evaluations and recommendations from the AERA Ethics and Fellows Committees, the Executive Board recommended to Council the removal of Robert D. Felner as an AERA member and a Fellow of the Association. Felner was convicted of a felony involving misappropriations of federal grants and contracts.

Motion: To accept the recommendation of the Executive Board to remove Robert D. Felner as an AERA member and AERA fellow. Approved unanimously.

12. Topics Discussed by the Division Vice Presidents

Division vice presidents provided feedback on the vice presidents' orientation, generally

held in conjunction with the June meeting of Council. It was suggested that the orientation be structured so that information sharing for new vice presidents would take place during the first half of the session and continuing vice presidents would join during the second half to share their experiences and answer questions. It was suggested that vice presidents structure the orientation meeting and that a few vice presidents volunteer to coordinate the effort. There would be a mechanism to evaluate new Council orientations. Finally, division vice presidents would inform AERA on whether they wished to have separate working dinners the evening before Council meetings.

Division vice presidents participated in a discussion that centered on how to align the Association's ambitions with its resources. The group asked if there is benefit in conducting a review of the current and future structure of AERA in light of the Association's role and aspirations in a global society. A key goal is to determine whether the current structure adequately represents the interests of education researchers. It was noted that there have been some fluctuations in the numbers of members in certain SIGs and divisions. Some units have seen a consistent decline over time while others, such as SIGs with a technology focus, have grown.

Council discussed the virtue of each division's preparing a history of itself, to be incorporated into materials to be assembled in conjunction with AERA's centennial celebration in 2016.

Council also discussed the importance of junior graduate student representatives in divisions. Nicholas Daniel Hartlep, Graduate Student Council (GSC) chair and representative to Council, asked the division vice presidents to provide a complete listing of their representatives and to urge their student members to consider running in GSC elections. It was noted that there is no common process for appointing junior representatives across divisions. Some divisions have a graduate student member already in line to succeed the current representative.

Ball discussed the importance of including the voice of graduate students. She indicated that she would like to integrate graduate students into the Presidential Sessions at the 2012 Annual Meeting. Hartlep will ask graduate students to submit essays

for the Annual Meeting Web page and to provide responses to the commissioned papers.

13. Review and Discussion of FY2011 Financial Report

Council was briefed on the budget projections based on 5 months of revenues and expenses for Fiscal Year 2011. Council had approved a budget for FY2011 consisting of \$7,778,514 in revenue and \$7,907,640 in expenses, with a budgeted deficit of \$129,126 (1.6% of budget); however, FY2011 is projected to end with a net income of \$60,923, excluding any unrealized gains and losses.

This favorable financial position as compared to budget can be attributed to a higher-than-expected net income produced by the 2011 Annual Meeting as a result of the high number of registrants (13,697 as compared to an estimated 13,250) and lower-than-budgeted expenses for audiovisual equipment rentals, facility setup, and telephone/Internet charges.

Divisions are projected to spend all of their approved budgets. Levine said that AERA needs to seek out new revenue streams. She indicated that this was a priority issue for her and Deputy Director Stevenson and that the Executive Board would be asked to give more consideration to this topic. Ball also asked Council to pay close attention to the increased costs of travel, particularly airfares, which have risen to record levels recently. She stressed the importance of booking travel early to contain costs.

14. Review of Division Budget Allocation

Division vice presidents recommended that Council review the formula for division budget allocations in light of the increase in membership dues in 2011. The discussion took place in February 2011, and the Central Office was charged with presenting recommendations for consideration by the Executive Board and Council in June. Given the decrease in membership to date, which may ultimately affect the allocation to divisions that membership dues are expected to generate, the Executive Board recommended that we not change the division budget allocation formula for Fiscal Year 2012. Instead, the Executive Board recommended that Council review the allocation formula in the context of the

Association's resource base in 2012, with an eye toward any changes that will be needed going into effect for Fiscal Year 2013.

Executive Director Levine indicated that in the interim, divisions will be provided with the same purchasing power for the 2012 Annual Meeting as they had for the 2011 Annual Meeting. The budget allocations for 2012 will be at the same levels as in 2011 for those divisions with fewer members in 2011; divisions with greater number of members will receive a larger allocation based on membership counts. In addition, AERA staff will work closely with division vice presidents in planning for catering activities for the 2012 Annual Meeting to ensure that divisions can feature receptions of similar quality.

Motion: To approve the Executive Board's recommendation for division budget allocation. Approved unanimously.

15. Annual Meeting Planning

Council was briefed on the immigration laws recently passed in Georgia. Given Council's decision not to hold meetings in Arizona when a similar immigration law was passed there, the discussion centered on whether AERA should move the 2013 Annual Meeting from Atlanta to another location. It was noted that there will be liability if AERA relocates, as AERA has a confirmed commitment to hold the meeting in Atlanta. A number of cities might serve as possible alternative sites. Gutiérrez noted that AERA's decision to pull out of Arizona because of the immigration laws had an important impact on the view of the immigration issue. Council received a report for review on the status of the Georgia law.

Motion: To approve the recommendation of the Executive Board that Council delegate responsibility to the Executive Board for the decision on whether to hold the 2013 Annual Meeting in Atlanta. The decision is to be made no later than the October Executive Board meeting. Approved unanimously.

16. High-Profile Initiative on Immigration and Education

Levine briefed Council on a possible initiative on immigration and education that could include a research workshop and a research volume or handbook. The idea for this initiative came from Richard Duran,

Chair of the Social Justice Action Committee, who expressed interest in research on immigrant children, families, and communities and their education and learning experiences. Since the link between immigration and education is a critical 21st-century issue, AERA could make an important research contribution, synthesizing knowledge and helping to shape future research and policy directions. Duran was encouraged to provide more specifics and present a plan to the Executive Board at the October meeting.

17. Annual Meeting Enhancements: Communications Technology and Program App

Stevenson briefed Council on the pilot program that featured the Annual Meeting program on a mobile phone application (app) at the 2011 Annual Meeting in New Orleans. She reported that the feedback has been positive and that more than 8,000 individuals have used the app. She highlighted a number of lessons learned from the pilot program, including the importance of communicating early about the availability and use of the app. She noted that the Central Office has begun planning for the 2012 Annual Meeting to ensure that U.S. attendees can download the app in advance without incurring international roaming charges in Vancouver.

18. Discussion Items

Ball provided an update on the orientation session for new committee chairs and committee members that was held at the 2011 Annual Meeting in New Orleans. She indicated that the session was well attended and attendees found it to be very useful.

Ball informed Council that Council members William Firestone, Marybeth Gasman, Luis Moll, and Gale Sinatra had been appointed to the Council Subcommittee on AERA-Wide Mentoring and Mentoring by AERA Organizational Units. In addition, Council members Laura Perna and Linda Skrla and President-Elect William Tierney were appointed to the Council Subcommittee on SIG Bylaws. Stevenson reported that the bylaws had been vetted by outside legal counsel. A third subcommittee is the Council Subcommittee on Roles and Responsibilities of Committees, whose members will be Arnetha Ball, Carol Lee, Member-at-Large

Vivian Gadsden, Kris Gutiérrez, and Felice Levine.

Ball indicated that she will be appointing chairs to these subcommittees in the near future.

Monday, June 27, 2011 (Meeting Day 2)

19. Executive Session

President Ball called the meeting to order at 8:45 a.m. Council met in Executive Session.

20. Draft Revision of Standards for Educational and Psychological Testing

Council was joined by Suzanne Lane, AERA's representative to the Joint Management Committee, via video conference call. She provided an update on the status of the revision of *Standards for Educational and Psychological Testing*, a joint project of the American Educational Research Association, the American Psychological Association, and the National Council on Measurement in Education. Lane reported on the revision process, which involved receiving over 4,000 public comments through open calls to members of the three associations. Once the revision is completed in 2012, the governing bodies of the three associations will be asked to approve the revised version for publication. Levine informed Council that both AERA and APA will be preparing a prospectus to publish the *Standards*; the last edition of the *Standards* was published by AERA. It was noted that the revenues generated from sales of the *Standards* are kept in a restricted account that funds the next revision.

21. Enhancing AERA's Communications Capacity

Stevenson briefed Council on the AERA website redesign project. She noted that it is a two-pronged effort involving redesign of the information architecture and website as well as implementation of a new association management system (AMS) and database. Stevenson indicated that the information architecture has been finalized. The goal is to make the website more dynamic and user friendly, providing logical entry points and navigation for different constituents and audiences. A process of collaborative consultation with relevant

committees on the design of the site has begun, to be followed by focus group discussions with committees, division vice presidents, SIG officers, and member volunteers. The AMS is an integral part of the new website, integrating the membership database and providing collaborative work space and social media platforms to enable Web-based communications. Stevenson noted that, in a related effort, the AERA logo will be redesigned.

22. Update on Advancing Education Research and Its Visibility

Levine provided an update on the Institute of Education Sciences (IES) Reauthorization initiative. With the release of *Report and Recommendations for the Reauthorization of the Institute of Education Sciences* in April, the recommendations issued by AERA have already become the backbone of important advocacy. Levine anticipates that a number of organizations will sign on to this report and the recommendations.

23. Education Research Projects and Forthcoming Reports/Publications

Council discussed the status of several ongoing AERA projects and initiatives.

Symposium on Indigenous Education in the 21st Century. Levine briefed Council on the status of a report on research on Indigenous education based on a research symposium held in February 2010. She indicated that the goal of the symposium was to synthesize and highlight the body of scholarly knowledge on Indigenous education and to help chart and address issues for future research. Levine noted AERA's substantial commitment to and investment in this initiative. Council discussed the hope and expectation that the report would be forthcoming this year and in time for the 2012 Annual Meeting, where Indigenous research issues will be a particular point of attention. Council discussed as well that Bryan Brayboy and his colleagues sought to undertake a research handbook on Indigenous education. Council members emphasized the importance of preparing a report of publishable quality before a handbook project is launched, given the time required to create a major book.

LGBTQ Research Initiative. Council discussed the progress of the Research

Initiative on Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender, and Queer (LGBTQ) Issues in Education and the research workshop held in September 2010. Levine indicated that considerable work was undertaken by George Wimberly, AERA director of social justice and professional development and staff study director of the project. She noted that the memorandum in the agenda book provided an update on the current plan to produce a published report in time for release and discussion at the 2012 Annual Meeting. Council members discussed the importance of this project. President-Elect Tierney indicated his concerns that the process had been protracted in both holding the research workshop and preparing a report. He urged some rethinking about the plan to bring the report to fruition. Levine noted that this project was a high priority and that any necessary additional actions would be pursued to ensure completion of the report.

Other projects. Background materials on the AERA-NAEd Assessment of Education Research Doctorate Programs, initiatives of the AERA Grants Program, and activities related to AERA education research advocacy that were provided to Council members in advance of the meeting were acknowledged but led to no additional discussion.

24. New Business and Adjournment

Council discussed ways to tap into the diverse expertise of AERA members and Fellows. It was suggested that AERA could enhance its profile as the main source for expertise on various areas of education research. Levine noted that media frequently contact AERA for referrals and names of experts in the field. She noted that, while AERA recommends experts, we do not advocate on specific issues. Levine emphasized the need for an accessible and polished information sheet that conveys nuggets of research knowledge and outlines scholarly contributions across the fields of education research. She encouraged the division vice presidents to provide information on the knowledge base in the areas within their divisions. An effective statement made available to the public, she noted, could be quite compelling.

Council discussed the value of collecting and featuring the ideas and perspectives of

members on emerging areas of importance to education research. Possible ways to highlight such information include an online forum to foster discussion on posted briefs and papers so that dialogues among researchers can generate different views and perspectives. Ball talked about the benefit of getting a broad look at the views of members on selected issues.

25. Council Meeting Planning

Council members thought that, if there were a shared commitment to reading all of the advance briefing materials, Council meetings could focus more attention on discussion of key issues for the field of education research, in addition to business and action items. Several Council members

recommended a process for gathering feedback after Council meetings to help with future planning. Ball and Levine indicated that an electronic form would be prepared.

26. Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 12:30 p.m.